BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03341 7320

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

CIVIL APPEALS & JUDICIAL REVIEW

Analysis, Process and Strategy in Civil Proceedings

Casebook

Volume I

JOHN A. CAMPION
PAUL F. MONAHAN
FASKEN CAMPBELL GODFREY
Toronto, Ontario
(416) 366-8381

Spring 1998

Prepared with the Assistance of
Jeffrey Legault, Student-at-Law,
Fasken Campbell Godfrey 1997-98

AZD 15 9
BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
DEC 5 1997
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

CIVIL APPEALS & JUDICIAL REVIEW

Analysis, Process and Strategy in Civil Proceedings

Casebook
Volume I

JOHN A. CAMPION
PAUL F. MONAHAN
FASKEN CAMPBELL GODFREY
Toronto, Ontario
(416) 366-8381

Spring 1998

Prepared with the Assistance of
Jeffrey Legault, Student-at-Law,
Fasken Campbell Godfrey 1997-98

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/civilappealsjudi01camp_5

CIVIL APPEALS AND JUDICIAL REVIEW

CASEBOOK - VOLUME I
TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

PART I - APPELLATE POWERS AND PROCEDURE

CHAPTER 1 - Final and Interlocutory Orders — Page No.

A. Merritt, "Final and Interlocutory Orders: An Analysis of the Present Law in Ontario" (1983), 4 *Advocates Quarterly* 484-499. — 1

Hendrickson v. Kallio, [1932] O.R. 675, [1932] 4 D.L.R. 580 (C.A.). — 17

Re Buck Bros. Limited et al. and Frontenac Builders Limited et al. (1994) 19 O.R. (3d) 97 (C.A.) — 23

CHAPTER 2 - Stay of Order Pending Appeal

International Corona Resources Ltd. v. Lac Minerals Ltd. (1986), 21 C.P.C. (2d) 252 (Ont. C.A.). — 32

International Corona Resources Ltd. v. Lac Minerals Ltd. (1987), 21 C.P.C. (2d) 256 (Ont. C.A.). — 36

RJR-Macdonald Inc. v. Attorney-General of Canada (1994) 111 D.L.R. (4th) 385 (S.C.C.) — 40

CHAPTER 3 - Question of Law; Question of Fact; Mixed Law and Fact

CNR v. Bell Telephone, [1939] S.C.R. 308 (S.C.C.). — 71

Re Schiller and Board of Governors of Scarborough General Hospital (1975), 9 O.R. (2d) 648 (C.A.). — 84

Wade v. Canadian National Railway Co. (1977), 80 D.L.R. (3d) 214 (S.C.C.). — 89

Ter Neuzen v. Korn [1995] 3 S.C.R. 674 — 109

Page No.

CHAPTER 4 - Scope of Review

R.D. Gibbens "Appellate Review of Findings of Fact", (1992), 13 *Advocates Quarterly*, pp. 445-452. 168

Lewis v. Todd et al. (1980), 115 D.L.R. (3d) 257 (S.C.C.). 176

Fletcher et al. v. Manitoba Public Insurance Co. (1990) 74 D.L.R. (4th) 636 (S.C.C.) 194

Appellate Advocacy by Mr. Justice John Sopinka 222

CHAPTER 5 - Scope of Review of a Discretionary Order

Marleen Investments Ltd. v. McBride (1979), 23 O.R. (2d) 125, 13 C.P.C. 221 (H.C.J.). 227

Stoicevski v. Casement (1983), 43 O.R. (2d) 436, 43 C.P.C. 178 (C.A.). 231

CHAPTER 6 - Setting Aside Jury Verdicts

Graham v. Hodgkinson (1983), 40 O.R. (2d) 697 (C.A.), leave to appeal to Supreme Court of Canada refused 51 N.R. 398. 241

Farrugia v. Springer (1992), 9 C.P.C. (3d) 55 (Ont. C.A.). 252

Anderson v. Maple Ridge (District) (1992), 10 C.P.C. (3d) 258 (B.C.C.A.), leave to appeal to Supreme Court of Canada refused (1993), 74 B.C.L.R. (2d) xxx (note). 256

CHAPTER 7 - Raising New Evidence and Issues on Appeal

New Evidence

Mercer v. Sijan (1976), 1 C.P.C. 281, 14 O.R. (2d) 12 (C.A.). 269

Sengmueller v. Sengmueller (1994), 17 O.R. (3d) 208, 25 C.P.C. (3d) 61 (C.A.). 276

Page No.

New Issues

Shaver Hospital for Chest Diseases v. Slesar (1980), 27 O.R. (2d) 383n, 106 D.L.R. (3d) 377n (referring for further consideration C.A., Ontario, (1979), 27 O.R. (2d) 383, 15 C.P.C. 97.) (C.A.). 287

CHAPTER 8 - Conduct of the Trial Judge

Phillips v. Ford Motor Co. of Canada Ltd., [1971] 2 O.R. 637, 18 D.L.R. (3d) 641 (C.A.). 295

J.M.W. Recycling Inc. v. Attorney-General of Canada (1982), 35 O.R. (2d) 355, 133 D.L.R. (3d) 363 (C.A.). 321

CHAPTER 9 - Costs and Awards - Reviewing Assessment of Damages

Walker v. CFTO Ltd. (1987), 59 O.R. (2d) 104, 37 D.L.R. (4th) 224 (C.A.). 331

Hill v. Church of Scientology of Toronto (1995), 126 D.L.R. (4th) 129 (S.C.C.). 350